I. FRAMEWORK

The impacts of migration in Turkey are complex and wide-ranging, affecting demographic, social and economic aspects of life. As migrants are increasingly incorporated into the economic and social fabric in Turkey in consequence of large-scale migration flows, adopting a development sensitive understanding of migration management and putting forward innovative integration policies gain more importance than ever. For an effective management of migration through a realistic understanding of the drivers and dynamics of migration, ICMPD supports the Government of Turkey by strengthening the capacity of national and local institutions and promoting the development of sustainable migration strategies and concepts.

In this direction, the SUMMIT project is based on the lessons learned from the two projects funded by State Secretary of Migration (SEM) and recently implemented by ICMPD in Turkey in this area. The Sessiz Destek - Support of a Development-sensitive and Coherent Turkish Migration Policy Framework project aimed at supporting the Directorate General for Migration Management (DGMM) in developing and implementing a development-sensitive and coherent migration policy. Complementing the Sessiz Destek Project, SIDEM- Support the Implementation of Development-sensitive Migration Policies in Turkey specifically aimed at increasing the institutional knowledge regarding the impact of migration on geographical regions in Turkey as well as institutional capacities and inter-agency cooperation at central level to design and implement integrated, evidence-based and development-sensitive migration policies.

Among the many valuable lessons learned from the two projects, several shaped the design of the SUMMIT Project. For effective migration management in Turkey, firstly, social and economic integration of migrants and refugees need to be given special attention. Secondly, migrant entrepreneurs and investors need to be supported by regional authorities and the private sector particularly due to their lack of knowledge on the Turkish legal and bureaucratic system. Thirdly, migrants find access to employment challenging especially in...
finding jobs matching their skill sets. In this context, the two projects highlighted the necessity for inclusive development strategies. Moreover, both projects demonstrated that communication and coordination among state institutions and other respective actors should be strengthened along with information and experience sharing mechanisms.

Within this framework, the objectives of the SUMMIT Project are to support the implementation of development sensitive migration policy and strategy at central and regional levels (1), to increase the institutional capacities on migration and development to formulate strategic policy directions with a special focus on entrepreneurship and labour market integration and to support development of policy framework documents (2), to support the development and implementation of labour market integration measures in selected sectors (3).

The main partners of the SUMMIT Project are the Directorate General of Migration Management, the Ministry of Family, Labour and Social Services, Presidency of Turkey, Presidency of Strategy and Budget, the Directorate General of Development Agencies of the Ministry of Industry and Technology, Regional Development Agencies in selected NUTS 2 regions and the local actors involved in the labour market integration of migrants.

II. SUMMARY

With the unprecedented numbers of migrants in Turkey, management of migration has become difficult and costly, in both human and financial terms. For better governance of harmonization, Turkey needs to manage the pressures on employment, housing, services on the one hand, the challenges stemming from the cultural, social and linguistic differences and lack of inclusion on the other hand.

The presence of a large number of migrants, with negative as well as positive implications and repercussions on the economic and overall development, necessitates the social and economic integration of those migrants in Turkey. Turkish labour market already has some structural problems such as informality, high rates of unemployment, increasing child labour, and low female labour force participation¹ accompanying the burden of migrants. At a time when limited job creation, high employment costs and low access to resources hinder Turkey’s growth, exploring the link between international migration and development can open new horizons of gains for Turkey. As the increasing volume and diversity of the migrant population demand effective migration management strategies in harmony with the goals of development, Turkey works to develop comprehensive policies and sustainable solutions.

Today, for the benefit of overall development, it is significant to assess the capacities and prospects in Turkey for creating employment opportunities along with the prerequisites of sustainable policies and measures for migrants’ socio-economic integration.² For Turkey to continue to develop its legislative and institutional structure in accordance with its economic needs, a migration-sensitive development frame is of key importance.³

Several arrangements have been made towards the formulation of attainable labour market integration policies in line with migration-sensitive development objectives. To exemplify, the General Directorate of International Labour Force of the Ministry of Family, Labour and Social Services has facilitated the access to labour for International Protection applicants and beneficiaries and SuTPs (Syrians under Temporary Protection) by granting exemptions in agriculture and animal husbandry and provided support in selected

¹ Arzu URAZ, Social Development Specialist, World Bank
² Tamer KILIÇ, Regional Coordinator, Western Balkans and Turkey, International Centre for Migration Policy Development (ICMPD)
³ Gizem GÖZALICI, Deputy Head of Migration Policy and Projects Department, Directorate General of Migration Management, Ministry of Interior
sectors and incentives for entrepreneurship.\textsuperscript{4} Besides, awareness of employers on the legal process of employment of migrants was increased and the terms of application for work permits of the Syrian nationals under temporary protection were simplified.\textsuperscript{5}

Yet, several issues still need to be taken into consideration for the exploration of a realistic pathway concentrated on the potential opportunities for migrants’ labour market integration through a sustainable socio-economic policy framework in Turkey.\textsuperscript{6}

To start with, the most critical challenge in the heart of migration governance and development nexus in Turkey is the presence of a large migrant population. Considering the 2 million Syrian nationals under temporary protection at working age on the one hand and approximately 250,000 international protection beneficiaries as well as an estimate of 200,000 residence permit holders along with an unknown number of irregular migrants entering from the Iranian border on the other hand, the Turkish labour market is under great pressure.\textsuperscript{7} Next to the component of population, migrant status also becomes influential in fostering the implementation of development goals and economic growth. More specifically, while regular migrants may bring along valuable opportunities, the economic integration of irregular migrants, which is a large category in Turkey, may be more burdensome.\textsuperscript{8} Hence, the status and size of the migrant population should be well assessed in designing the road map for migrants’ labour market integration in line with Turkey’s development goals.\textsuperscript{9}

The second challenge in the application of a migration-sensitive development approach concerns the complications regarding the institutional structure in the field. Here, the fact that some of the projects funded by international donors and embassies are output-oriented rather than result-oriented causes unnecessary duplication of services and leads to inefficiency on the ground.\textsuperscript{10} To exemplify, output-oriented results such as the number of people given vocational courses and language training may be misleading in the monitoring and evaluation reports of the projects in comparison to those who can actually speak Turkish.\textsuperscript{11} Here, the complementarity between development policies and projects should be utilized as a major opportunity to implement the development goals on the ground.\textsuperscript{12}

Another challenge regarding migrants’ socio-economic integration concerns their permanence in the labour market. Here, it should be brought to attention that foreign migrants might have different work cultures.\textsuperscript{13} Additionally, a significant question will be the linkage between social assistance and employment, and whether the provision of social aid impedes migrants’ labour integration.\textsuperscript{14} Hence, exploring a migrants’ length of employment at a certain workplace and the common reasons for quitting their jobs is necessary to pave the way for permanence and sustainability.\textsuperscript{15}

\textsuperscript{4} Sadettin AKYIL, Director General, Directorate General of International Labour Force, Ministry of Family, Labour and Social Services
\textsuperscript{5} Ali Ercan SU, EU Expert, General Directorate of International Labour Force, Ministry of Labour and Social Security
\textsuperscript{6} Sadettin AKYIL, Director General, Directorate General of International Labour Force, Ministry of Family, Labour and Social Services
\textsuperscript{7} Ali Ercan SU, EU Expert, General Directorate of International Labour Force, Ministry of Labour and Social Security
\textsuperscript{8} Hande HACIMAHMUTOĞLU, Head of Health, Employment and Social Protection Department, Directorate General of Sectors and Public Investments, Presidency of Strategy and Budget
\textsuperscript{9} Asst. Prof. Dr. Saime ÖZÇÜRÜMEZ, Bilkent University
\textsuperscript{10} Sadettin AKYIL, Director General, Directorate General of International Labour Force, Ministry of Family, Labour and Social Services
\textsuperscript{11} Arzu URAZ, Social Development Specialist, World Bank
\textsuperscript{12} Asst. Prof. Dr. Saime ÖZÇÜRÜMEZ, Bilkent University
\textsuperscript{13} Sadettin AKYIL, Director General, Directorate General of International Labour Force, Ministry of Family, Labour and Social Services
\textsuperscript{14} Asst. Prof. Dr. Saime ÖZÇÜRÜMEZ, Bilkent University
\textsuperscript{15} Arzu URAZ, Social Development Specialist, World Bank
In linkage to the notion of ensuring migrants’ access to employment, the impacts of the increase in the labour supply stemming from the large migrant population at working age should be underlined. In this context, unless demand increases, the pressure on wages causes migrants to work for lower wages and replace the locals. Moreover, when the increase in the labour supply is not accompanied with positive impacts on the technology capacity, vision of the firms, or employment opportunities, the efficiency dimension is weakened. In contrast, improving the governance of migration following the steps of a firm development plan will help to transform these negative impacts into promising opportunities.

Within this framework, solutions developed without involving the private sector may lack sustainability. Private sector may facilitate access to economic opportunities in line with the economic policies, which aim to increase the availability of decent jobs for migrants. Consisting of full profit commercial entities, financial institutions, entities, investors, intermediaries, micro, small, medium and large size companies along with local, regional and multinational businesses, private sector can create jobs. Despite its homogeneity, the involvement of the private sector not only brings along innovation and expertise to address the specific challenges arising on the way, but as the solutions are market based and aiming for profit, it also ensures sustainability.

To build a successful private sector engagement and to motivate the private sector to cooperate in this involvement, enticing assets may be the provision of access to finance including credits, loans and guarantees, access to human capital, the expertise of potential partners from the public sector, facilitated access to local markets and networks, availability of multi-stakeholder partnerships, counting on the state’s support if difficulties arise on the ground and corporate social responsibility. As the private sector is diverse, the framework of engagement must be flexible, transparent and with a clear attribution of roles, in line with all parties’ interests and convenient profit making.

Through the engagement with the private sector, various challenges in relation to migration can be solved. To start with, many migrants lack the necessary skills required for employment and in parallel, many employers encounter difficulties in finding employees with required skills and adequate qualifications. Hence, private sector may contribute to skills development and enhancement. Here, proper information on skills recognition and validation mechanisms and setting up trainings in line with the needs of employers, strengthening qualified apprenticeships designed in harmony with the actual work setting are crucial. Next, companies hiring migrants may be included in the supply-chain of private companies. In this line of thinking, private sector may also sponsor refugee entrepreneurs. With regards to entrepreneurship, the entrepreneurship models of the private sector, non-governmental organisations and traditional entrepreneurship models should be tested and possibly transformed as social entrepreneurship and social cooperatives for the benefit of migrants.

Overall, while the involvement of the private sector in the solutions for the implementation of migration-sensitive development policies and initiatives is crucial, the successful integration process is still a result of joint efforts and coordination of different stakeholders and both economic and social partners at local, regional and national levels.

---

16 Şeref SAYGILI, Economist, The Central Bank of Turkey
17 Şeref SAYGILI, Economist, The Central Bank of Turkey
18 Justyna FRELAK, Technical Advisor, International Centre for Migration Policy Development (ICMPD)
19 Arzu URAZ, Social Development Specialist, World Bank
20 Sergo MANANASHVILI, Senior Advisor, International Centre for Migration Policy Development (ICMPD)
21 Marcin GRABIEC, Head of Migration Policy, Delegation of the European Union to Turkey
22 Sergo MANANASHVILI, Senior Advisor, International Centre for Migration Policy Development (ICMPD)
23 Arzu URAZ, Social Development Specialist, World Bank
III. CONCLUDING REMARKS AND SUGGESTIONS

Migration— an area of both vertical depth and horizontal space, is multisectoral because it contains different sectors such as education, health and youth and is multiplex with national, regional and local levels to work separately and together in harmonization.24 As migration represents an intersection, policy development, implementation and the regulation of the distribution of roles between central government and local institutions require utmost harmonization.

To foster the implementation of development goals and economic growth through the application of a migration-sensitive development approach, the 11th Development Plan, covering the 2019-2023 term and providing a detailed and holistic view of migration, serves as a major guide.25 According to the 11th Development Plan, the areas of agriculture, defence industry and tourism as well as the primary sectors of chemistry, medicine and medical equipment, electronics, machines and electronics equipment, automotive and rail system equipment are listed as the areas of development, a major pathway is to enrich qualified human resources.26 Hence, in managing transitions from temporary measures to permanent solutions in socio-economic integration and considering the scale of newborns in Turkey, investing in human capital; particularly child and youth development will be crucial to develop the production capacity.27 Moreover, according to the Development Plan, attracting qualified foreign labour force holds an important place for the aim of contributing to economic and social development.

Regarding the legislation on the migration and development nexus, proactive policies on labour market integration of migrants and facilitations of certain incentives towards regular employment have been gradually integrated since 2003. Yet, for migrants’ labour market integration to serve Turkey’s development goals, the balance between migration and economic growth in Turkey should be assessed especially in terms of forced migration after a realistic identification of the number of migrants that could be economically integrated.28 In this direction, Turkey has made sectorial and regional research on employment gaps29 through a population perspective consisting of migrants’ birth rates and potential labour surplus.30

Along these lines, the identification of new sectors which hold the potential of creating more jobs will be facilitated with the involvement of the private sector and exploration of innovative ways such as the expansion of production chains by using migrant networks, possibly in the form of producing in Turkey and selling to the European market through the network of Syrian nationals.31 In line with this thinking, the role of the private sector might take various forms ranging from ad hoc advisory support, active involvement in the policy design

---

24 Ahmet ŞİMŞEK, Head of Department, Coordination of Regional Development Agencies Department, General Directorate of Development Agencies, Ministry of Industry and Technology
25 Mr. İbrahim Emre İLYAS, Expert in the population and migration sectors at the Presidency of Strategy and Budget
26 Hande HACIMAHUTOĞLU, Head of Health, Employment and Social Protection Department, Directorate General of Sectors and Public Investments, Presidency of Strategy and Budget
27 Arzu URAZ, Social Development Specialist, World Bank
28 Tamer KILIÇ, Regional Coordinator, Western Balkans and Turkey, International Centre for Migration Policy Development (ICMPD)
29 Sadettin AKYIL, Director General, Directorate General of International Labour Force, Ministry of Family, Labour and Social Services
30 Hande HACIMAHUTOĞLU, Head of Health, Employment and Social Protection Department, Directorate General of Sectors and Public Investments, Presidency of Strategy and Budget
31 Tamer KILIÇ, Regional Coordinator, Western Balkans and Turkey, International Centre for Migration Policy Development (ICMPD)
and policy making to direct provision of services and measures related to integration. While employer organisations may support the process of skills validation and completion of qualifications, the chambers of commerce may play a key role especially in developing and upgrading skills.\textsuperscript{32}

Most importantly, as growing skills mismatch is a major challenge and skills shortage is negatively impacting productivity, private sector’s talent acquisition to people who do not possess the necessary skills for certain jobs by encouraging work-based learning is crucial.\textsuperscript{33} Private companies’ guarantee to employ the participants of work-based learning programmes may serve the sustainability of this approach. Apart from migrants’ access to employment, it should be added that the level of interactions at the workplace in which employers have a major role to play are crucial.\textsuperscript{34} In this regard, while migrants’ access to labour market represents the first step, social cohesion at the workplace, as the second step, should be addressed through a security perspective not only in the form of regulations but also at the level of interactions.\textsuperscript{35}

Overall, if migration is governed poorly, it will impact Turkey’s development negatively. Thus, Turkish economy needs to grow, and employment opportunities need to increase along with new investments. Several suggestions reveal the numerous alternatives that can be implemented in Turkey with a migration-sensitive understanding of development. To begin with, organised industrial sites, free zones and small industrial areas may serve development well if the local development goals are to be combined with national development policies.\textsuperscript{36} In line with this, a new incentive system which grades the infrastructures of different provinces in accordance with the needs of enterprises which work for the integration of migrants may be helpful. In parallel, entrepreneurship ecosystems in Turkey may support the migrant entrepreneurs which will help them to compete and manufacture high value-added products. To increase the innovative capacities of migrant receiving regions, migrants could be supported in areas such as financial literacy, legal procedures, entrepreneurship and innovation through consultancy or innovation centres. In this context, the focus should not only be employment for small and medium sized enterprises and private sector, instead the aim should be to deliver more inclusive and meaningful solutions of the challenges.\textsuperscript{37}

In terms of effective governance of migration, municipalities, governorships, development agencies, provincial employment boards, all local actors and public and non-governmental organisations have important roles in market integration and development. Yet, in spite of their key role in migrants’ integration, local authorities often lack a voice in the policy-making process and they remain as the implementing partners of policies made by the central authorities.\textsuperscript{38} Instead, for a better governance of this complex environment, local government bodies need to contribute to the national policy makers and central government.\textsuperscript{39} Likewise, migrants’ inclusion in urban councils and participation in designing the strategic plans may be helpful.\textsuperscript{40} Finally, in regions facing difficulties due to the unexpected refugee influx, local development agencies need strategy documents and databases or platforms for better coordination and cooperation that will involve governorships, municipalities, and chambers of commerce and industry.\textsuperscript{41}

\textsuperscript{32} Justyna FRELAK, Technical Advisor, International Centre for Migration Policy Development (ICMPD)
\textsuperscript{33} Göksen SERT, Director of International Relations and Projects, Turkish Confederation of Employer Associations (TISK)
\textsuperscript{34} Marcin GRABIEC, Head of Migration Policy, Delegation of the European Union to Turkey
\textsuperscript{35} Asst. Prof. Dr. Saime ÖZÇÜRÜMEZ, Bilkent University
\textsuperscript{36} Ahmet ŞİMŞEK, Head of Department, Coordination of Regional Development Agencies Department, General Directorate of Development Agencies, Ministry of Industry and Technology
\textsuperscript{37} Lütfi ALTUNSU, General Secretary, Çukurova Development Agency
\textsuperscript{38} Ramón Palomino GARCIA, Former Cabinet Director for Madrid’s Vice Mayor in charge of Equity, Social Rights and Employment
\textsuperscript{39} Ahmet ŞİMŞEK, Head of Department, Coordination of Regional Development Agencies Department, General Directorate of Development Agencies, Ministry of Industry and Technology
\textsuperscript{40} Ramón Palomino GARCIA, Former Cabinet Director for Madrid’s Vice Mayor in charge of Equity, Social Rights and Employment
\textsuperscript{41} Lütfi ALTUNSU, General Secretary, Çukurova Development Agency
In conclusion, as labour market integration of migrants should be planned well with the aim of managing transition from temporary measures to permanent and sustainable solutions and should not be left solely to market demands\textsuperscript{42}, ultimately, a well-functioning decision-making mechanism should involve all the relevant parties.\textsuperscript{43}

\textsuperscript{42} Omar KADKOY, Policy Analyst, Economic Policy Research Foundation of Turkey (TEPAV)

\textsuperscript{43} Arzu URAZ, Social Development Specialist, World Bank